



ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

June 6, 2024

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: Michael W. Wymer, PE, Senior Production Engineer

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "MWW", is written to the right of the "From:" line.

Subject: Contract W-035-B
Storage Tank Refurbishing – Sandridge
ECWA Project No. 202300060

On Thursday, May 23, 2024, the Authority received three (3) bids for the above referenced contract. The bids have been reviewed, a mathematical check has been performed, and the apparent lowest responsible and responsive bidder, Amstar of WNY, Inc. (Amstar), was found acceptable.

Amstar is an established contractor for the Authority who has previously worked on ECWA tank refurbishment contracts, performing the work in a competent, reliable, and acceptable manner. They have demonstrated a good understanding of the scope and requirements for this contract.

In recognition of the difference in bid price with respect to the other bidders, a pre-award conference call was held between Amstar, the consultant (Wendel), and the Authority. Amstar stated they are comfortable with the price bid and will complete the work according to the requirements of the Project Manual (consultant meeting notes dated May 28, 2024 are attached).

Amstar has provided adequate insurance, approved by the Claims Representative/Risk Manager, proof of apprenticeship program, approved by the Coordinator of Employee Relations, and MWBE documentation, approved by the EEO Compliance Officer.

We, therefore, recommend the award of the above referenced contract in the amount of \$1,900,000.00 to Amstar of WNY, Inc.

Budget Information (2024 Construction):

Department No.: 250 – Engineering/Construction

Unit 2502: Construction

Item No. 74: Payments to Contractors-Tanks (\$4,896,618.00 currently remains)

Attached please find the following documents:

1. ECWA Authorization Form.
2. ECWA Recommendation for Award of Contract form.
3. Letter of recommendation from Wendel, dated March 1, 2024, and Bid Tabulation.
4. Consultant Pre-award Telephone Conference notes dated May 28, 2024.

MWW:jmf

Attachments

cc: L.Kowalski

L.Lester

CONT-W-035-B-2301-X-12

ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
AUTHORIZATION FORM
For Approval/Execution of Documents
(check which apply)

Contract: <u>W-035-B</u>	Project No.: <u>202300060</u>
Project Description: <u>Storage Tank Refurbishing – Sandridge</u>	

Item Description:

<input type="checkbox"/> Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> Professional Service Contract	<input type="checkbox"/> Amendment	<input type="checkbox"/> Change Order
<input type="checkbox"/> BCD	<input type="checkbox"/> NYSDOT Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> Contract Documents	<input type="checkbox"/> Addendum
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Recommendation for Award of Contract	<input type="checkbox"/> Recommendation to Reject Bids		
<input type="checkbox"/> Request for Proposals			
<input type="checkbox"/> Other _____			

Action Requested:

<input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Execute	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Legal Approval
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Award	<input type="checkbox"/> Execution by the Chairman
<input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Advertise for Bids	<input type="checkbox"/> Execution by the Secretary to the Authority
<input type="checkbox"/> Board Authorization to Solicit Request for Proposals	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	

Approvals Needed:

APPROVED AS TO CONTENT:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sr. Production Engineer	<u><i>Michael G. Zylman</i></u>	Date: <u>6/7/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chief Operating Officer	<u><i>[Signature]</i></u>	Date: <u>06/10/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Executive Engineer	<u><i>Leonard F. Koralick</i></u>	Date: <u>6/10/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Director of Administration	<u><i>Savanya Lester</i></u>	Date: <u>06/10/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Risk Manager	<u><i>Molly Jo Musarra</i></u>	Date: <u>6/10/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chief Financial Officer	<u><i>Oppe Ambr</i></u>	Date: <u>06/07/2024</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Legal	<u><i>Mark Carney</i></u>	Date: <u>6/10/2024</u>

APPROVED FOR BOARD RESOLUTION:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Secretary to the Authority	<u><i>[Signature]</i></u>	Date: <u>6/10/2024</u>
--	---------------------------	------------------------

Remarks: _____

Resolution Date: _____	Item No: _____
-------------------------------	-----------------------

**ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT**

Contract: W-035-B Project No.: 202300060
 Project Description: Storage Tank Refurbishing – Sandridge.

CONTRACT AWARD

Contractor/Supplier: Amstar of WNY, Inc.
 Award Amount: \$1,900,000.00

BID SUMMARY:

Date Advertised for Bids: 04/30/2024 Date of Bid Opening 05/23/2024

Bidder	Total Bid Amount
<u>Amstar of WNY, Inc.</u>	<u>\$1,900,000.00</u>
<u>Erie Painting and Maintenance, Inc.</u>	<u>\$3,440,000.00</u>
<u>Atlas Painting and Sheeting Corp.</u>	<u>\$3,789,000.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>
_____	<u>\$0.00</u>

Attachments: Bid Tabulation Consultant's Recommendation

APPROVALS (Select applicable)

WMBE APPROVAL

No Waiver
 Full Waiver
 Partial Waiver

EEO Compliance Officer *Savanya Leste* Date 06/06/2024

INSURANCE APPROVAL

Claims Rep/Risk Manager *Molly Jo Musarra* Date 6/6/2024

NYS CERTIFIED APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAM APPROVAL

Coordinator of Employee Relations *[Signature]* Date 6/6/2024

Remarks: _____



May 28, 2024

Mr. Michael Wymer, PE
Erie County Water Authority
3030 Union Road
Cheektowaga, NY 14227-1097

**SUBJECT: ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY
 STORAGE TANK REFURBISHING - SANDRIDGE
 CONTRACT No.: W-035B
 RECOMMENDATION OF AWARD
 ECWA PROJ. NO. 202300060
 WENDEL PROJ. NO. 239844**

Dear Mr. Wymer:

Three (3) bids on the above referenced project were received and opened on May 23, 2024, in accordance with the Notice to Bidders previously authorized.

A summary of the bids is attached for your reference. After review of the bids, Wendel recommends award of the Base Bid for Contract No. W-035B Storage Tank Refurbishing: Sandridge to Amstar of Western New York, Inc. (Amstar) based upon their low Base Bid of \$1,900,000.00.

We have had a discussion with Amstar and reviewed their understanding of the scope and requirements of this project. We are confident that they have a clear understanding of the project and they indicated that they are comfortable with their bid price.

Sincerely,
WENDEL

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads 'Timothy G. Walck'.

Timothy G. Walck, PE

Enclosure

CC via email: Leonard Kowalski, PE – ECWA
 Catherine Knab, PE, PMP – JMD

Jaime Davidson, PE – JMD
Lauren Glose, PE - Wendel

BASE BID
 PROJECT : ECWA Storage Tank Refurbishing - Sandridge
 CONTRACT : W-035B
 DATE : 5/24/2024

TABULATION OF BIDS
 PAGE 1

++ INDICATES CONTRACTOR ERROR			NO. 1 Amstar of Western New York, Inc. Cheektowaga, NY Bid Bond			NO. 2 Erie Painting & Maintenance, Inc. Cheektowaga, NY Bid Bond			NO. 3 Atlas Painting and Sheeting Corp. Amherst, NY Bid Bond		
ITEM #	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY UNITS	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL		UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL		UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED TOTAL	
1	For Interior Wet Painting - Full Recoat	1 LS	521,600.00	521,600.00	0	890,000.00	890,000.00	0	900,000.00	900,000.00	0
2	For Interior Dry Spot Refurbishment	1 LS	161,000.00	161,000.00	0	407,000.00	407,000.00	0	350,000.00	350,000.00	0
3	For Exterior Painting - Full Recoat	1 LS	708,000.00	708,000.00	0	1,500,000.00	1,500,000.00	0	1,100,000.00	1,100,000.00	0
4	For Tank Lettering	1 LS	5,000.00	5,000.00	0	20,000.00	20,000.00	0	10,000.00	10,000.00	0
	For Disposal of Wet Interior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue										
5	for Full Recoat	1 LS	2,000.00	2,000.00	0	5,000.00	5,000.00	0	1,000.00	1,000.00	0
6	For Disposal of Exterior Hazardous Abrasive Blast Residue	1 LS	2,000.00	2,000.00	0	5,000.00	5,000.00	0	1,000.00	1,000.00	0
7	For Shell Plate and Floor Repair - Cover Plate	4 SF	500.00	2,000.00	0	2,000.00	8,000.00	0	2,000.00	8,000.00	0
8	For Steel Plate Butt Weld Repair	10 LF	200.00	2,000.00	0	1,200.00	12,000.00	0	500.00	5,000.00	0
9	For Pit Welding	10 EA	40.00	400.00	0	1,200.00	12,000.00	0	500.00	5,000.00	0
10	For Epoxy Seam Sealing and Pit Filling	2 GAL	500.00	1,000.00	0	500.00	1,000.00	0	1,000.00	2,000.00	0
11	Miscellaneous Modifications	1 LS	95,000.00	95,000.00	0	180,000.00	180,000.00	0	300,000.00	300,000.00	0
12	For Containment	1 LS	200,000.00	200,000.00	0	200,000.00	200,000.00	0	907,000.00	907,000.00	0
13	Contingency Allowance for Repairs	1 LS	200,000.00	200,000.00	0	200,000.00	200,000.00	0	200,000.00	200,000.00	0
			CONTRACTOR TOTAL=	\$ 1900000.00	0	CON TOTAL=	\$ 3440000.00	0	CON TOTAL=	\$ 3789000.00	0
			ACTUAL TOTAL=	\$ 1900000.00		ACT TOTAL=	\$ 3440000.00		ACT TOTAL=	\$ 3789000.00	
MIN BID =			1900000.00			BID RANKING	1		BID RANKING	2	
						BID RANKING	2		BID RANKING	3	

ECWA W-035B
Pre-award Telephone Conference
May 28, 2024 at 11:00 AM
Teams Call

Attending: Amstar – Bruce Cozad, Wendel – Lauren Glose and Tim Walck, ECWA – Mike Wymer

1. Any questions on the plans, specs or addendums? Any concerns?
 - a. No questions. Amstar visited the tank and knew exactly what they needed to do. No concerns with the specs.
2. Did you find any issues or inconsistencies?
 - a. No issues or inconsistencies found.
3. Any concerns with the completion deadline?
 - a. No concerns with completion deadline. Amstar would like to start on dry interior in August also. Mike doesn't see a concern with starting interior dry in August, but needs to check with others at ECWA. However, Amstar can complete the work by deadline even if they can't start early. More about keeping Amstar's guys busy.
4. Are you comfortable with your bid?
 - a. Yes, they are comfortable. They can bond it. They needed the work. Bruce not concerned with how much lower Amstar bid than the other bidders. Bruce said that if more companies bid the work, we would have seen other numbers closer to theirs.
5. Any subs?
 - a. They are not planning on subs at this time. May need a GC sub for pavement/CB work.
6. Coatings Manufacturer?
 - a. Tnemec
7. Any concerns with MWBE or Apprentice requirements?
 - a. No concerns. Union contractor.
8. Any other questions?
 - a. JMD Engineering (Cati Knab) will be doing the inspection as part of Wendel's team.
 - b. Analysis of tank will be required by structural engineer that attaching rigging for containment tarping will not affect structure of tank.
 - c. Bruce requested that Wendel get him set up in Procore early so that he can start getting submittals to us.