



ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

February 13, 2019

To: Jerome D. Schad, Chairman
Mark S. Carney, Vice Chairman
E. Thomas Jones, Treasurer

From: Russell J. Stoll, Executive Engineer

Subject: Request for Proposals
Professional Engineering Services for Waterline Replacement project
Lake Shore Road (Route 5) – NYSDOT Betterment
ECWA Project No. 201900008

The Erie County Water Authority (Authority) recently issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) to eight consulting engineering firms for the Lake Shore Road (Route 5) – NYSDOT Betterment replacement project.

The Authority is planning a waterline replacement project on Lake Shore Road (Route 5) as a betterment with the New York State Department of Transportation. The project will involve the replacement of existing waterline within the Authority's Direct Service Area. The project is scheduled for design in 2019 and construction in 2020.

The project will entail the replacement of approximately 2,500 linear feet of new transmission waterline from First Street to the pedestrian overpass located approximately 280 linear feet south of Hawley Road in the Town of Hamburg, New York. The existing 24-inch diameter cast iron pipe (CIP) waterline will be abandoned in place. The sizes and type of new waterline will be determined as a part of the design project but will be a minimum 24-inch diameter. Project will be a betterment with the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), so plans and estimate will use NYSDOT pay items and standards. Erie County Water Authority (ECWA) standards will be incorporated into the design set, cross referencing NYSDOT pay items.

Project is for survey, design, general, and special services only. Full-time inspection will be provided for by NYSDOT forces.

This is a single project requiring one consulting engineering firm. Two of the eight firms declined to propose including GHD and Wendel. Those submitting proposals are listed in alphabetical order below:

- CHA Consulting, Inc.
- Clark Patterson Lee
- Erdman Anthony & Associates, Inc
- GPI (Greenman-Pedersen, Inc.)
- Nussbaumer & Clarke, Inc.
- Wm. Schutt & Associates

Jerome D. Schad, Chairman
Mark S. Carney, Vice Chairman
E. Thomas Jones, Treasurer

- 2 -

February 13, 2019

The proposals were reviewed and discussed among the engineering staff (Russell Stoll, Leonard Kowalski, and Steven Denzler). Experience, staffing, scope, and project approach were considered. It was determined that each firm appeared generally qualified to perform the work proposed. However, since this project included close involvement and coordination with NYSDOT particular qualifications and experience is an important element to be considered. While all the firms had the depth of experience with Authority standards, design procedures, construction standards, and technical specifications, not all had similar experience related to NYSDOT.

Based on the review and evaluation of the proposals and considering the level of effort proposed by these firms, it was determined that the top qualified and experienced firms are:

- CHA Consulting, Inc.
- Erdman Anthony & Associates, Inc
- GPI

These firms have demonstrated a higher level of qualifications and experience in both: large diameter pipe and transmission mains as well as NYSDOT design procedures and practices. These three firms also provided a thorough and detailed technical project understanding and approach for the proposed project.

Of these three, CHA Consulting has appropriate level of effort and is competitive and reasonable for the work being proposed. They have a depth of knowledge and experience with Authority standards, design procedures, construction standards and procedures and technical specifications. In addition, they have experienced staff to provide the design and construction phase services required by the Authority and the NYSDOT. CHA Consulting has a competitive professional fee when compared to any of the other firms' proposals for this project.

I am requesting the Board's approval to move forward and develop a professional services contract with CHA Consulting, Inc. for the above referenced project.

RJS:jmf
cc: T. McCracken
ECWA-928-1902